



# E-PARCC

COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE INITIATIVE

Syracuse University

Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs

Program for the Advancement of Research on Conflict and Collaboration

## Ukraine in Conflict SIMULATION

### Summary

*Ukraine In Conflict* is a multiparty negotiation that acts as a skill-building exercise. In this simulation Ukraine, the European Union, Russia, and Ukraine Separatists are brought together by the United States, acting as mediator, to resolve the warring conflict in eastern Ukraine. Issues to be discussed are land, trade-pacts, and a plane crash investigation. Participants in the negotiation will garner skill in collaboration, crisis negotiation, off-table discussions, and negotiation without information. The purpose of the simulation is to bring a real-world conflict in a realistic situation to allow creative solutions as well as development of skills in crisis negotiation.

This simulation was an honorable mention place winner in E-PARCC's 2014-15 "Collaborative Public Management, Collaborative Governance, and Collaborative Problem Solving" teaching case and simulation competition. It was double-blind peer reviewed by a committee of academics and practitioners. It was written by Zachary W. Barr and Steven Smutko of the University of Wyoming. This simulation is intended for classroom discussion and is not intended to suggest either effective or ineffective handling of the situation depicted. It is brought to you by E-PARCC, part of the Syracuse University Maxwell School's Collaborative Governance Initiative, a subset of the Program for the Advancement of Research on Conflict and Collaboration (PARCC). This material may be copied as many times as needed as long as the authors are given full credit for their work.

## Background

The Ukraine conflict began in December 2013 when former pro-Russian Prime Minister Viktor Yanukovich backed out of a trade agreement with the European Union (EU) and instead took a loan from Russia under the assumption Ukraine would join the Russian Trade Pact. The supposed reason for the break in communication between the EU and Ukraine was because Russia threatened to withhold its supply of natural gas to force Ukraine to enter into a trade and political agreement with them rather than sign the EU.<sup>1</sup> The Prime Minister's decision sparked protests in Ukraine. Combating the protests, Yanukovich passed an anti-protest law banning protesters from wearing masks or helmets to rallies and requiring police permission for setting up tents or sound equipment for demonstrations. At first, the Ukraine Parliament repealed the law, but deputies loyal to the Prime Minister overturned it. After the repealed law was overturned, protesters turned out en masse pressing constitutional reform.<sup>1</sup>

February 27-28, 2014 saw pro-Russian Separatists, with help from Russia, seize capital buildings in the southern peninsula of Crimea.<sup>2</sup> The Separatists in Crimea voted to join Russia and called a referendum.<sup>2</sup> Ukraine eventually withdrew troops from Crimea and has essentially given up control of the region. Crimea is banned from electing officials for the Ukrainian government.<sup>2</sup>

The pro-Russian uprising spread east on April 7, 2014 when Separatist forces occupied government buildings in the cities of Donetsk, Luhansk, and Kharkiv.<sup>2</sup> Eventually the Separatists in Donetsk and Luhansk declared independence on May 11 after the referendums.<sup>2</sup>

Presidential elections were held in May 2014, after Ukraine's parliament ousted President Yanukovich and instated speaker of the parliament Oleksandr Turchynov as interim President. No polling stations were allowed in Donetsk and other areas in conflict.<sup>2</sup> Petro Poroshenko was elected and on June 20 announced a 15-point peace plan along with a week-long truce that was later abolished when a military helicopter was shot down over eastern Ukraine.<sup>2</sup> July 5 saw a small win for Ukraine when they drove back Separatists to southern strongholds of Donetsk.<sup>2</sup>

The fighting has seen many tragic events such as the shooting down of a Malaysian airliner MH17 on July 17, 2014 carrying 300 passengers, which were mostly Malaysian and Dutch citizens. The public has been outraged by this tragedy. First world leaders such as the United States, the United Kingdom, and Germany have demanded an investigation to discover who is responsible for the act. After the downing of flight MH17, Russia took control of the airplane's black box to investigate what brought down the plane. However, it is doubtful that the Russian

---

<sup>1</sup> Ahmed, Saeed, Greg Botelho, and Elliott C. McLaughlin. "20 Questions: What Is Russia's Interest in Ukraine?" *Cnn.com*. CNN, 4 Mar. 2014. Web. 22 Sept. 2014. <<http://www.cnn.com/2014/03/01/world/europe/ukraine-protests-explainer/index.html>>.

<sup>2</sup> "Ukraine in Maps: How the Crisis Spread." *BBC News*. BBC News, 4 Nov. 2014. Web. 06 Dec. 2014.

investigation will get to the truth since much of the evidence points to the Russian backed Separatists as being the ones who brought down the airliner. <sup>3</sup>

On August 27, 2014 Separatists allegedly backed by a Russian armor division took the town of Novoazovsk on the southern shore of Donetsk, threatening the port of Mariupol. <sup>4</sup> Fighting stopped when a ceasefire was agreed upon by Separatists and Ukraine on September 5, a day before NATO declared it was setting up a rapid reaction force. However, fighting at the Donetsk airport soon erupted just four days later.<sup>1</sup>

Elections were held for a new parliament on October 26, 2014. The eastern parts of Ukraine boycotted the elections and held their own election on November 2, electing two pro-Russian leaders.<sup>1</sup>

In reaction to the downing of the Malaysian airliner and Russia's backing of Ukrainian Separatists the European Union has enacted sanctions on many Russian companies and important government officials. <sup>5</sup>

## Ukraine in Conflict

### General Information for All Negotiators

Ukraine is in a state of unrest. Pro-Russian Separatists have taken over most of the Luhansk and Donetsk regions in the country declaring themselves a part of Russia after the former Prime Minister of Ukraine backed out of a trade agreement with the European Union (EU) and agreed to a trade pact with Russia. The decision by the Prime Minister sparked protest in the western side of Ukraine. Reacting to the protest, the Prime Minister enacted legislation banning protests, only causing more conflict resulting in his fleeing to Russia.

The eastern part of Ukraine is mostly ethnic Russian. Once the Prime Minister was pushed out of the country, pro-Russian Separatists in the south and east began occupying government buildings (the Prime Minister was a popular figure in the eastern regions). The first big win for the Separatists was the capture of Crimea.

Early on in this conflict, Crimea (the southern peninsula of Ukraine) was completely separated to form an autonomous republic. From the start of the Crimea conflict Russia has backed the

---

<sup>3</sup> Gordits, Eline. "Malaysia Airlines Plane Crash: Flight Shot Down Over Ukraine." *The Huffington Post* 17 July 2014: n. pag. *The Huffington Post*. Web. 22 Sept. 2014. <[http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/07/17/malaysia-airlines-plane-cras\\_n\\_5595516.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/07/17/malaysia-airlines-plane-cras_n_5595516.html)>.

<sup>4</sup> "Ukraine in Maps: How the Crisis Spread." *BBC News*. BBC News, 4 Nov. 2014. Web. 06 Dec. 2014.

<sup>5</sup> Dahlburg, John-Thor. "EU Sanctions to Target Russian Businesses, Documents Show." *Huffingtonpost.com*. The Huffington Post, 25 July 2014. Web. 22 Sept. 2014. <[http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/07/25/eu-sanctions-russia-ukraine\\_n\\_5622624.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/07/25/eu-sanctions-russia-ukraine_n_5622624.html)>.

Separatists. However, it is only been in the past 6 months that Russia's Prime Minister has admitted to helping the Separatists in the eastern parts of Ukraine.

During the Crimean conflict, the European Union (EU) placed sanctions on major government officials in Russia as well as the country in general.

Unfortunately there have been civilian lives lost in the conflict when Malaysian Airlines flight MH17, flying from Amsterdam to Malaysia and carrying mostly Dutch passengers, was shot down. Amidst the conflict the EU has attempted to conduct an investigation into the downing of the Dutch airliner. At first both sides agreed to a ceasefire, but within days the conflict re-erupted which prevented the investigation to continuing safely. The black box, containing important flight information, is currently possessed by Russia.

Elections have come and gone for Ukraine which has barred Crimea, Donetsk, and Luhansk from electing officials, causing the regions to hold their own election where pro-Russian leaders have been elected.

The conflict is a sensitive situation given that Russia supplies most of Europe's natural gas, and the sanctions have interrupted supplies, hurting the global gas market and Europe alike. Since Russia has turned the tap off, the United States has supplied Europe with supplies of natural gas, once provided by Russia. This has resulted in a depletion of the United States' national reserves.

The Separatists have made it known that they wish the regions of Donetsk and Luhansk to be Russian to reflect the population of ethnic Russians that reside there. The pro-Russian Separatists have even gone so far as to declare themselves politically separate from Ukraine and reports from Ukrainian soldiers have said that Russian flags flown over Separatist territory are not rare.

The fighting between Ukraine and Russian backed-Separatists has gotten out of hand. The United States fears that more civilian casualties could be seen in the future if there is not a ceasefire and an ultimate peace decided between the differing sides.

Ukraine, the Separatists, Russia, and the EU have been called by the United States to convene in Geneva to reach an agreement.

## **Stakeholders**

The United States will be represented by Vice President Jeoff Hofferan, newly appointed after the previous Vice President died while in office. Hofferan was educated at Dartmouth in political science and later studied international conflict. The Vice President has been trusted to go in the President's stead while the President is dealing with domestic economic and environmental issues. Hofferan proposes to take a mediating role in the negotiations.

The EU will be represented by a delegation led by Hans Schliemann, a Dutch native who represents the Netherlands in the European Union. Schliemann's an educated man from Harvard where he majored in International Studies and later Economics to receive his PhD specializing in world trade.

Ukraine will be represented by a team led by Poro Schmelker, Ukraine's newly elected president. Schmelker is a war hero who, early on in this conflict, single-handedly saved 80 civilians in Crimea by safely escorting them across the peninsula. Schmelker's rise to power was swift, and his following is very strong with little opposition.

The pro-Russian Separatists are represented by the newly elected leader in the Luhansk region, Yohan Rusprovanski and his delegation. An ethnic Russian who grew up in Moscow, it is rumored that he is a KGB spy who went to Ukraine to incite conflict and overthrow the government.

The Russian delegation will be represented by their Prime Minister Gladimir Hurtin, a former KGB operative who is considered a long-time "tough guy." Hurtin was educated in Moscow and was a political student of the previous Prime Minister.

## The Issues

### Land

The Eastern part of Ukraine is heavily ethnic Russian, and the people there for the most part wish to be part of Russia. Russia has supported the Separatists and believes that the ownership of the land is in their right. The southern port of Mariupol in the Donetsk region is of great economic importance to Ukraine which is hurting economically. The options for land are as follows:

**Option 1:** Russia is given Luhansk and any ethnic Russians from Donetsk will be paid to be moved and housed in Luhansk by Russia.

**Option 2:** Russia has the option to purchase land from Ukraine in the Donetsk and Luhansk territory for 500€/m<sup>2</sup>. If Russia purchases the port of Mariupol, Ukraine will earn 10% of the trade from the port for five years with minimum payments of 1,000,000€ annually.

**Option 3:** Ukraine will cede the Luhansk territory to the Separatists. Any Donetsk resident who is able may relocate from Donetsk to Luhansk.

**Option 4:** Ukraine will regain control of both Donetsk and Luhansk regions, and any who want to leave Ukraine to live in Russia may do so.

**Option 5:** New territorial boundaries are drawn for Russia and Ukraine, and half of Luhansk and Donetsk will be under Russian control.

### **Trade-Pacts**

Ukraine is in economic peril and desperately needs to enter into an international trade agreement with the EU, or Russia. A main reason the conflict began was due to the Ukrainian Prime Minister backing out of a trade agreement with the EU and taking a loan from Russia. Here are the following trade-pact options:

**Option 1:** Ukraine will enter a temporary trade agreement with the EU for 5 years. At the end of the 5 year probation period their status as a European Union Nation will be considered.

**Option 2:** Ukraine will become a part of Russia's Trade Pact.

### **Investigation of the Downing of Flight MH17**

Innocent lives have been lost because of the downed airliner. The delay of the investigation of how and why the airliner crashed has left a lot of questions unanswered for the Netherlands and the families of the deceased. Bringing justice to the families would include a trial and charges for war-crimes against those accused. The options are as follows:

**Option 1:** The EU will conduct the investigation.

**Option 2:** A joint taskforce between Ukraine and the pro-Russian Separatists will conduct an investigation.

**Option 3:** As a neutral party, the United States will conduct the investigation.

## Map for Reference



From: <http://www.abc.net.au/news/interactives/ukraine-conflict-in-maps/>

## **Confidential Information for the EU Delegation**

### **Hans Schliemann, Chief Negotiator**

The European Union delegation is led by Hans Schliemann. Even though Schliemann is Dutch and could be considered biased in his negotiations of the airline investigation, the EU trusts his professionalism in the situation. This negotiation is especially important because Schliemann has high ambitions for his political career in the EU.

The EU's main goal for the negotiation is to ensure that Russia gains the least economically. A second objective is to help bolster Ukraine's economy.

You would prefer that the United States would not be the mediator in the issue. You are concerned that the United States may attempt to manipulate the negotiations to further their agenda. They are considered an ally but you are wary of their position as mediator.

The EU has given you the option to leverage sanctions in your favor to achieve your objectives. Since the Russians have stopped exporting natural gas to Western Europe, you have been buying natural gas from the United States. You wish to regain your natural gas agreement with Russia but are uncertain of the stance of Russia.

The following is your stance on all of the issues and any restraints you have in the negotiation.

#### **Land:**

This issue is of moderate importance to you. Your preferred outcome on this issue would be for Ukraine to keep the port of Mariupol. Your preferred options are 3 and 4. You do not want option 2 because of the chance the port of Mariupol being lost to Russia. Option 5 is also not favorable. Since this issue is of moderate concern to you, you may agree to any option.

#### **Trade:**

This issue is of high importance to you. Before the conflict the EU was very close to a trade agreement that benefited both Ukraine and the EU. You wish to regain ground that you lost when the conflict began. You prefer the first option and highly dislike the second.

#### **Airline Crash Investigation:**

Personally this issue is highly important to you, while the EU marks this as a moderately important issue. Since your whole country will be watching your performance in this negotiation, you would like to do justice by the Dutch people. You will not allow Russia to conduct this investigation which does not allow you to agree on option 3; you also are not fond of option 2.



## **Confidential Information for Jeoff Hofferma**

You are Jeoff Hofferma, recently appointed Vice President of the United States. The President has asked you to represent the United States' interests as well as mediate this negotiation. This is only your fourth week in your term as Vice President, so this is the perfect opportunity to prove yourself and gain more political power in the States. If you do well as a mediator the President will give you his backing in the next presidential election.

As a mediator your goal is to make sure that the negotiation is conducted efficiently and that an outcome is reached. You are particularly concerned that the EU or Russia might attempt to take control of the talks. Instead, you want the Ukraine and the Separatists to work out their own deals, and not be unduly influenced by the EU and Russian negotiators.

Even though you are acting as mediator in this negotiation you are mindful of the United States' position on the issues. Of particular concern to you is the U.S. natural gas reserves. Since the U.S. has been supplying the EU with natural gas when this crisis began, the current U.S. reserves are at an all-time low. Although the natural gas "drought" in Western Europe has allowed the US to sell its gas at a premium price, thus reducing the nation's debt, you are worried that eventually it will completely deplete the reserves.

You have heard that the EU wants to resume its previous arrangement with Russian gas suppliers. The United States stands to greatly benefit from the switch back to Russian gas and take the pressure off of the United States as a source of supply.

Remember as the mediator you should control the amount of talking time each party gets, and help the other negotiators stay on topic. You should also try to look at the negotiation objectively, and help create solutions and tradeoffs that may not be seen by other parties.

The structure of the negotiation may have a great effect on the outcome so remember to create an equal and fair structure to the negotiation that benefits all parties.

## **Confidential Information for the Ukrainian Delegation**

### **Poro Schmelker, Chief Negotiator**

Your delegation is led by the Ukrainian war hero of Crimea Poro Schmelker, and will be representing Ukraine in this issue. Schmelker has a strong following in Ukraine as the newly elected President, elected on the promise of change. This is his opportunity to show he means change for the better.

The goals for Ukraine in this negotiation are to strengthen the country economically, end the conflict permanently, and regain your nation's standing in the European community (the EU). Also, you want to keep most of Ukraine intact.

Your delegation strongly resents Russia's role in exacerbating this conflict and do not want them to gain from the negotiations. However, you understand, and are somewhat sympathetic to the fact that ethnic Russians do not feel like they are a part of Ukraine.

If negotiations with all parties are not going well you have been given the authority to speak directly to the Separatists to negotiate a truce with them, giving them the option to secede from Ukraine, as long as there is no involvement from Russia in their government.

The following is your stance on each issue and any restraints you have.

#### **Land:**

This issue is of moderate importance to you. Keeping Ukraine intact is important but as long as you retain the port in Mariupol, you are willing to deal with the Separatists to cede other territories as long as Russia does not gain any land. You highly prefer options 4 and 3, and you do not see very much difference between options 1 and 2. You do not want to settle on option 5, although it wouldn't be a deal killer if you did.

#### **Trade:**

Although you want to increase Ukraine's economic power this issue is of little importance to you. The country's economic need is so bad the way you see it, no matter what happens you will receive the economic stability you need from this negotiation so you do not see any difference in who provides it.

#### **Airliner Crash Investigation:**

This issue is of little importance to you. Although you do have heavy feelings for the unnecessary loss of life by the passengers of the flight, you know that the Ukraine forces are not responsible for its shooting down and do not care who will conduct the investigation. However, keep in mind the EU representative is Dutch and that receiving a better standing with the EU will help Ukraine in the long-run.

## **Confidential Information for the Separatist Delegation, Yohan Rusprovanski, Chief Negotiator**

Your delegation is led by the recently elected leader of the Separatists in the Luhansk region Yohan Rusprovanski. You will be representing all Separatists in this negotiation.

The goals for the Separatists in this negotiation are to completely separate from Ukraine and reinforce Russia's power if possible. Another objective is to be sure that the Separatists remain in charge of the investigation of the airliner crash.

You have reliable information that the plane was shot down by a Separatist combatant. You are keenly aware that if the world discovers that your Separatist soldiers were responsible for the death of hundreds of civilians, Rusprovanski may be persecuted for war crimes. You want to ensure that you have the most control over the outcomes of the crash investigation.

The following is your stance for each issue and any constraints you have.

### **Land:**

This issue is of high importance to you. You want to either receive land outright to be occupied by ethnic Russians, or for Russia to gain territory in Luhansk or Donetsk. You recognize the economic significance of the port of Mariupol, but gaining that land is not as important to you as acquiring the Donetsk and Luhansk territories. You highly prefer option 1 or 2, seeing little difference between the two. You will not agree to option 4.

### **Trade:**

This issue is of little importance to you. Although you prefer option 2 you do not see much of a difference between it and the other options.

### **Airliner Crash Investigation:**

This issue is of high importance to you. You are sure Separatist troops were responsible for the downing of the airliner and want to have your own hand in the investigation. You prefer option 2 or 3 and will not agree on option 4.

## **Confidential Information for the Russian Delegation**

### **Gladimir Hurtin, Chief Negotiator**

Your delegation is led by the Prime Minister of Russia, Gladimir Hurtin. You will be representing Russia in the upcoming negotiation. Hurtin has been in power for years now, and has a reputation as a strong-arm politician who gets his way. Hurtin was chosen by the previous Prime Minister to continue his long-term plan to return Russia to the glory of the Soviet Union. The system Hurtin has set up in Russia has given him power that is final and long lasting. However, you believe it is time to start taking back what was once the Soviet Bloc.

Your delegation's primary goal in this negotiation is to gain land from Ukraine. You would also be fine with the Separatists gaining land in the region knowing their loyalty lies with Russia.

Another objective you have for this negotiation is to convince the EU to remove the financial sanctions it has placed on Russian companies and some of its leaders. You fear if you do not have the sanctions lifted you will lose support from wealthy Russians and lose power. You are also wary of having your own country revolt against you.

You can leverage the control of natural gas to Western Europe, preferably to gain an upper hand in the negotiation with the EU.

The following is your stance on each issue and any restraints you may have.

#### **Land:**

This issue is of high importance to you. If you can gain land in the negotiation the sanctions the EU placed on you will be considered worth the trouble. Also, if you can gain possession of the port of Mariupol you would be happy. You strongly support options 5 and 2. You cannot agree on option 4 and do not see any difference between 1 and 3.

#### **Trade:**

This issue is of moderate importance to you. You want the Russian Trade Pact to increase in power although you are not sure whether adding Ukraine will help. Also, if the EU does not accept Ukraine as a member it will help your Russian Trade Pact. You strongly prefer option 2. Although you do not have any constraints you will work hard to fight against option 1.

#### **Airliner Crash Investigation:**

This issue is of little importance to you. Although you know war-crimes charges may be filed against you for supplying the missile that shot down the aircraft, you are confident that the Separatists will take most of the fall for the downing of the plane. You have no constraints on this issue.